

# Saṅgārava Sutta – The Discourse to Saṅgārava

## Translation of the Discourse to Saṅgārava and the Relevant Commentaries

### Part One: The Contemporary Ascetic Traditions

474. "Evaṃ, bho"ti kho saṅgāravo māṇavo dhanañjāniyā brāhmaṇiyā paṭissutvā yena bhagavā tenupasaṅkami; upasaṅkamitvā bhagavatā saddhiṃ sammodi.	474. "Yes, friend," replied indeed the young man Saṅgārava to the brahmin woman Dhanañjāni and approached the Exalted One where He (was). After (he) approached (Him), (they) exchanged courteous talk. <sup>1</sup>
Sammodaniyaṃ kathaṃ saraṇiyaṃ vītisāretvā ekamantaṃ nisīdi.	When the courteous talk on important (matters) was finished, (the brahmin) sat on one side. <sup>2</sup>
Ekamantaṃ nisinno kho saṅgāravo māṇavo bhagavantaṃ etadavoca –	And sitting on one side, the young man Saṅgārava told this to the Exalted One:
"santi kho, bho gotama, eke samaṇabrāhmaṇā diṭṭhadhammābhiniññāvosānapāramippattā, ādibrahmacariyaṃ paṭijānanti.	"Indeed, friend Gotama, certain ascetics (and) brahmins have attained the supernatural knowledge of the present reality, (as well as) the final end (of the defilements, the Enlightenment), (and) proclaim the origin of holy life.
Tatra, bho gotama, ye te samaṇabrāhmaṇā diṭṭhadhammābhiniññāvosānapāramippattā, ādibrahmacariyaṃ paṭijānanti, tesāṃ bhavaṃ gotamo katamo"ti?	There, friend Gotama, those ascetics (and) brahmins who have attained the supernatural knowledge of the present reality, (as well as) the final end (of the defilements), (and) proclaim the origin of holy life – who is the Exalted Gotama in comparison to them?
"Diṭṭhadhammābhiniññāvosānapāramippattānaṃ, ādibrahmacariyaṃ paṭijānantānampi kho ahaṃ, bhāradvāja, vemattaṃ vadāmi.	I, Bhāradvāja, proclaim difference among those who have attained the supernatural knowledge of the present reality, (as well as) the final end (of the defilements), (and) proclaim the origin of holy life.
Santi, bhāradvāja, eke samaṇabrāhmaṇā anussavikā.	There are, Bhāradvāja, some ascetics (and) brahmins just following (what they) hear. <sup>3</sup>

<sup>1</sup> Literally "(he) rejoiced with (him)". This is a phrase often used to indicate a meeting of two friendly (or not unfriendly) persons, which starts with questions like "are you healthy?" "Do you have everything you need?" Etc. (See e.g. in *Pārājika Pāli – Catuttha Pārājika – Vinīta Vatthu*: "*kaccāvuso khamaniyaṃ kacci yāpaniyaṃ.*") It is comparable to today's "how do you do" in UK. The UK version is however not taken seriously, and instead of a particular answer you'd just answer "how do you do" too. There were many times when a monk met a monk, and asking them "are you healthy?" they would reply they are sick, and then the visitor would make efforts to help that monk.

<sup>2</sup> There are six places that are not appropriate for sitting down, as explained by the Commentary to *Pārājika Pāli – Verañjakaṇḍavaṇṇanā*: (1) *atidūraṃ* - too far (the teacher will have to shout at the student), (2) *accāsannaṃ* - too close (the teacher's natural movement is obstructed), (3) *uparivātaṃ* - in the direction of the wind (e.g. if the wind blows on the teacher from front right side, if the student sits in the front right side, the wind will carry the potential smells from the student's mouth (and other smells) to the teacher), (4) *unnatappadesaṃ* - on a higher seat (the student would show disrespect by assuming a superior position), (5) *atisammukhaṃ* - directly in front (the teacher loses his natural view), (6) and *atipacchā* - behind (the teacher would have to turn his head to see the student).

<sup>3</sup> According to what we learn from the next sentence, they just hear and speak, but do not attain the attainments themselves. Here "hearing" is not just overhearing something, here is meant the ancient way of teaching and learning – the teacher utters a

<i>Te anussavena diṭṭhadhammābhiññāvosānapāramippattā, āḍibrahmacariyaṃ paṭijānanti; seyyathāpi brāhmaṇā tevijjā.</i>	They, by repeating (what they heard), (say that they have) attained the supernatural knowledge of the present reality, (as well as) the final end (of the defilements), (and) proclaim the origin of holy life – such as the brahmins of Three Knowledges (i.e. Three Vedas).
<i>Santi pana, bhāradvāja, eke samaṇabrāhmaṇā kevalaṃ saddhāmatkena diṭṭhadhammābhiññāvosānapāramippattā, āḍibrahmacariyaṃ paṭijānanti; seyyathāpi takkī vīmaṃsī.</i>	However, Bhāradvāja, there are certain ascetics (and) brahmins, (who) (believe they have) attained the supernatural knowledge of the present reality, (as well as) the final end (of the defilements), (and) proclaim the origin of holy life – entirely just by faith (that it is so) – such as the thinkers-philosophers. <sup>4</sup>
<i>Santi, bhāradvāja, eke samaṇabrāhmaṇā pubbe ananussutesu dhammesu sāmaṃyeva dhammaṃ abhiññāya diṭṭhadhammābhiññāvosānapāramippattā, āḍibrahmacariyaṃ paṭijānanti.</i>	There are, Bhāradvāja, certain ascetics (and) brahmins, who themselves, indeed, attained the supernatural knowledge of the present reality, (as well as) the final end (of the defilements) by supernatural knowledge of the Truth, (and) proclaim the origin of holy life.
<i>Tatra, bhāradvāja, ye te samaṇabrāhmaṇā pubbe ananussutesu dhammesu sāmaṃyeva dhammaṃ abhiññāya diṭṭhadhammābhiññāvosānapāramippattā, āḍibrahmacariyaṃ paṭijānanti, tesāhamasmi.</i>	There, Bhāradvāja, out of those ascetics (and) brahmins who themselves, indeed, attained the supernatural knowledge of the present reality, (as well as) the final end (of the defilements) by supernatural knowledge of the Truth, (and) proclaim the origin of holy life, I am (One).
<i>Tadamināpetam, bhāradvāja, pariyāyena veditabbam, yathā ye te samaṇabrāhmaṇā pubbe ananussutesu dhammesu sāmaṃyeva dhammaṃ abhiññāya diṭṭhadhammābhiññāvosānapāramippattā, āḍibrahmacariyaṃ paṭijānanti, tesāhamasmi.</i>	It also should be understood (/ "known") in this way: in the way those ascetics (and) brahmins themselves, indeed, attained the supernatural knowledge of the present reality, (as well as) the final end (of the defilements) by supernatural knowledge of the Truth, (and) proclaim the origin of holy life, I am (One) out of them (who attained that in the same way). <sup>5</sup>

sentence or a verse, and the student repeats in the way they hear it. Then the teacher trains the student by uttering and being repeated again and again, in different ways (e.g. uttering beginning and expecting to hear end, asking to recite beginning and himself ending, etc.) until the student "grasps" all of the sentences, paragraphs, and texts, that have to be immaculately memorized and retained for whole their lives, exactly as they learned from their teacher. The same method of teaching-learning was followed by Buddhist monks for the first three centuries before the scriptures were written down in ca. first century BC., and many more centuries after.

<sup>4</sup> I.e. they just think and ponder over how the reality might work, what is right and what is wrong, but themselves didn't experience the entire freedom from defilements. For example, those who suppose "perhaps I am now Enlightened because I didn't break any of the five precepts for a long time" would be included in this category.

<sup>5</sup> According to the verbatim Pāli-Burmese translation here the Buddha spoke about the previous Buddhas, i.e. those that did not live any more, so obviously He did not mean any of the contemporary ascetics. See for example AN 4.24.10. Samaṇa Sutta, where the Buddha explained that only in His teachings there were Enlightened beings, nowhere else in the world: "*Idheva bhikkhave samaṇo, idha dutiyo samaṇo, idha tatiyo samaṇo, idha catuttho samaṇo; suññā parappavādā samaṇebhi aññehīti.*" = "Only here, monks, is an ascetic (with the first stage of Enlightenment), here is an ascetic with the second (stage of Enlightenment), here is an ascetic with the third (stage of Enlightenment), here is an ascetic with the fourth (stage of Enlightenment); the other teachings of other (teachers)

474. <i>Diṭṭhadhammābhiññā vosānapāramippattāti diṭṭhadhamme abhiññāte imasmiññeva attabhāve abhijānitvā vositavosānā hutvā</i>	474. "Attained the supernatural knowledge of the present reality, (as well as) the final end (of the defilements)" means that (they) say "we have attained the supernatural understanding of the present reality in this very life, and having supernaturally understood (the reality) (we,) having ended the (defilements that should be) ended,
<i>pāramīsaṅkhātāṃ sabbadhammānaṃ pārabhūtaṃ nibbānaṃ pattā mayanti vatvā ādibrahmacariyaṃ paṭijānantīti attho.</i>	attained the Enlightenment ( <i>/ Nibbāna</i> ), (being) the overcoming of all the phenomena known as (those that should be) overcome," (and) they proclaim the origin of holy life.
<i>Ādibrahmacariyanti brahmacariyassa ādibhūtā uppādakā janakāti evaṃ paṭijānantīti vuttaṃ hoti.</i>	"Origin of holy life" is said (meaning) they proclaim that (they) are the originators, the pioneers, the creators of the holy life.
<i>Takkīti takkagāhī.</i>	"Thinkers" (means) (they) attach to assumptions.
<i>Vīmaṃsīti vīmaṃsako, paññācāraṃ carāpetvā evaṃvādī.</i>	"Philosophers" means a philosopher; he teaches by instructing conduct (in the form of) wise behavior.
<i>Tesāhamasmīti tesāṃ sammāsambuddhānaṃ ahamasmi aññataro.</i>	"Of them I am (One)" means out of those Rightly and Self Awakened Ones I am One.

475. <i>'Idha me, bhāradvāja, pubbeva sambodhā anabhisambuddhassa bodhisattasseva sato etadahosi – 'sambādho gharāvāso rajāpatho, abbhokāso pabbajjā.</i>	475. Here, Bhāradvāja, before (my) complete Enlightenment, when not supernaturally Enlightened, just when I was a <i>bodhisattā</i> <sup>6</sup> , it occurred to me: "Life in a house is narrow (by the little opportunity for spiritual progress), dusty (by the abundant opportunity for mental defilements), (whereas) going forth is (like) open space.
<i>Nayidaṃ sukaraṃ agāraṃ ajjhāvasatā ekantaparipunṇaṃ ekantaparisuddhaṃ saṅkhalikhitaṃ brahmacariyaṃ carituṃ.</i>	Dwelling in a house, it is not easy to live the holy life entirely complete, entirely pure, (like) a conch shell.
<i>Yaṃnūnāhaṃ kesamassuṃ ohāretvā kāsāyāni vatthāni acchādetvā agārasmā anagāriyaṃ pabbajeyya'nti.</i>	What if I shaved off ( <i>/</i> "removed") (my) hair (and) beard, covered (myself) in robes (dyed in) tree-bark-dye, and went forth from home to homelessness.

are void of (Enlightened) ascetics." The same statement occurs also in *MN 11. Cūlasīhanāda Sutta* and *DN 16. Mahāparinibbāna Sutta*. There is also a simile explaining the vast difference between the benefit of following other ascetic traditions and that of following the Buddha in *SN 2. Nidānavaggaṇī – 2. Abhisamayasaṃyuttaṃ – 11. Tatiyapabbatasuttaṃ*. There the benefit of a Stream-Enterer (*Sotāpanna*)'s attainment vs. the attainments of ascetics of other sects and teachings are respectively compared to the amount of rock in the huge Mountain Meru/Sineru vs. seven seeds of sesame.

<sup>6</sup> *Bodhisatta* ("being (to be) Awakened") is the portion of Siddhattha Gotama when he was not yet a Buddha, and it also includes large number of the previous lives since the time he was predicted by Padumuttara Buddha to be a Buddha in future. The 547 *jātakas* available to us today are believed to be accounts of some of those previous lives when the Buddha-To-Be trained in perfecting the Ten Perfections (generosity, morality, renunciation, wisdom, effort/energy, patience, truth/integrity, determination, loving-kindness, and equanimity).

<i>So kho ahaṃ<sup>7</sup>, bhāradvāja, aparena samayena daharova samāno susukāḷakeso bhadrena yobbanena samannāgato paṭhamena vayasā akāmakānaṃ mātāpitūnaṃ assumukhānaṃ rudantānaṃ kesamassuṃ ohāretvā kāsāyāni vatthāni acchādetvā agāasmā anagāriyaṃ pabbajīṃ.</i>	Hence I, Bhāradvāja, at a later time, being just young, of fresh black hair, endowed with youthful (/ "good") age, in the prime of life, to the unhappy parents <sup>8</sup> weeping tears (over their) face, removed (my) hair (and) beard, covered (myself) in robes (dyed in) tree-bark-dye, and went forth from home to homelessness.
--	---

<i>MN 26. Pāsārāsīsuttavaṇṇanā</i>	Commentary to MN 26. Discourse on The Variety of Fetters
<i>277. Tattha daharova samānoti taruṇova samāno.</i>	277. There "being just young" means "being just youthful".
<i>Susukāḷakesoti suṭṭhu kāḷakeso, añjanavaṇṇakesova hutvāti attho.</i>	"Of fresh black hair" means rightly black hair, like the hair (that have) the color of collyrium <sup>9</sup> .
<i>Bhadrenāti bhaddakena.</i>	"Youthful (/ "good")" means favorable.
<i>Paṭhamena vayasāti tiṇṇaṃ vayānaṃ paṭhamavayena.</i>	"In the prime of life" means in the first age of the three ages (/stages of life). <sup>10</sup>
<i>Akāmakānanti anicchamānānaṃ, anādaratthe sāmivacanaṃ.</i>	"Unhappy" means undesiring; the (word) "not appreciative" ( <i>anādaratthe</i> ) is in genitive case.
<i>Assūni mukhe etesanti assumukhā; tesam assumukhānaṃ, assukilinnamukhānanti attho.</i>	"Tears in the face" thus they are of tearful faces; to them of tearful faces, to (those) of faces smeared by tears, (that is) the meaning (here).
<i>Rudantānanti kanditvā rodamānānaṃ.</i>	"(To them,) weeping" means sobbing and weeping. <sup>11</sup>

<sup>7</sup> "So (*kho*) *ahaṃ*" is apparently a grammatical expression peculiar to the ancient Pāli language. The Burmese translation says "that me the Lord-to-be" ("ဝိသိသုဓ်းလောင်းသည်"). The intended meaning here perhaps is "thus", "me indeed", "me and no one else" etc.

<sup>8</sup> The mother of the prince Siddhattha passed soon after she gave him birth. However, her sister *Mahāpajāpatī Gotamī* took care of the prince as if he was her own true son.

<sup>9</sup> Collyrium (*añjana*) was commonly used as eyewash, eye-lotion.

<sup>10</sup> The Sub-Commentary explains this was when the *bodhisatta* was 29 years old; the "first age" is until the age of 33.

<sup>11</sup> At this point someone may ask: "Well, didn't the prince Siddhattha escape from the palace at night, not seen by anybody apart from his charioteer Channa, who took him to the river Anomā on the horse Kaṇḍaka/Kaṇṭaka? Didn't they actually pass through the city-portal opened at night by deities (because otherwise city-portals were always locked at night)? Didn't the prince cut off his hair famously at the river Anomā and threw them in the air, thinking: "if they don't fall down (i.e. if they disappear in the air), I will become a Buddha" – whereafter Sakka, the king of gods, took them from the air to build the Cūlāmuni pagoda in his heaven (and so the hair never fell down)?" The most important thing to keep in mind is that the Buddha told to His audience only that what was helpful on their spiritual path. I suppose that narrating the story of His secret escape from palace would not be particularly useful to the audience in their practice of ethics etc., hence the Buddha didn't mention it. The others of course knew it from the members of the prince's large Sakyan family. Also note, that the story of the prince Siddhattha's secret escape from the palace at night is included in *sixteen* different texts throughout all of the *Tipiṭaka* Commentaries – in four of the five *Nikāyas*, in *Vinaya Piṭaka*, and *Abhidhamma Piṭaka* as well. To show the importance of the story in the way the Elders presented it I have collected all relevant references to the Commentarial account: **(1)** *MNA 1, (vol.2), 3. Opammavaggo - 6. Pāsārāsīsuttavaṇṇanā - para. 53; (2)* *SNA 3.1.8.6. Sīhasuttavaṇṇanā - para. 9; (3)* *ANA 1 13. Ekapuggalavaggavaṇṇanā - para. 21; (4)* *ANA 1 14.(14)1. Paṭhamaetadaggavaggo - Aññāsikoṇḍaññattheravatthu - para. 18; (5)* *ANA 4 1.4.3. Sīhasuttavaṇṇanā - para. 9; (6)* *KNA Dhammapada (vol.1), 1.8. Sāriputtattheravatthu -*

<i>So evaṃ pabbajito samāno kiṃkusalaḡavesī anuttaraṃ santivarapadaṃ pariyesamāno yena āḡāro kāḡāmo tenupasaṇkamīṃ; upasaṇkamitvā āḡāraṃ kāḡāmaṃ etadavocaṃ –</i>	Then thus, having gone forth, (I) was searching what was skilful, the supreme word (/ "Enlightenment") of the ultimate peace. Seeking (that), I approached where there was Āḡāra Kāḡāma. Having approached (him), I told this to Āḡāra Kāḡāma:
<i>'icchāmaḡaṃ, āvuso kāḡāma, imasmiṃ dhammaṃvinaḡe brahmacariyaṃ carituṃti.</i>	"Friend <sup>12</sup> Kāḡāma, I want to live holy life in this teachings and discipline."
<i>Evaṃ vutte, bhāradvāja, āḡāro kāḡāmo maṃ etadavoca – 'viharatāyasmā.</i>	Saying so, Bhāradvāja, Āḡāra Kāḡāma told me this: "May the venerable sir stay (here);
<i>Tādiso ayaṃ dhammo yattha viññū puriso nacirasseva sakaṃ ācariyakaṃ sayamaṃ abhiññā sacchikatvā upasampajja vihareyyāṃti.</i>	This is the kind of teachings, where the knowledgeable man might soon attain, enter, and dwell by (his) own supernatural knowledge in the (attainment) of (his) own teacher."
<i>So kho aḡaṃ, bhāradvāja, nacirasseva khippameva taṃ dhammaṃ pariyaḡpuṇīṃ.</i>	Hence I, Bhāradvāja, soon, indeed quickly, mastered that teachings.

<i>Kiṃ kusalaḡavesīti kiṃ kusalaṃti ḡavesamāno.</i>	"(I) was searching what was skilful" means (he was) searching (thinking) "what is skilful?"
<i>Anuttaraṃ santivarapadanti uttamaṃ santisaṇkhātaṃ varapadaṃ, nibbānaṃ pariyesamānoti attho.</i>	"Supreme word of ultimate peace" means the ultimate word of the highest expression of peace, meaning (he) was searching for the Enlightenment ( <i>Nibbāna</i> ).
<i>Yena āḡāro kāḡāmoti ettha āḡāroti tassa nāmaṃ, dīḡhapiṇḡalo kireso.</i>	"There where (was) Āḡāra Kāḡāma," there Āḡāra is his name, indeed he (was) long and brown. <sup>13</sup>
<i>Tenassa āḡāroti nāmaṃ aḡosī.</i>	Thus his name became (to be) "Āḡāra".
<i>Kāḡāmoti ḡottaṃ.</i>	"Kāḡāma" is the clan (where he was born).

*para. 11; (7) KNA Dhammapada (vol.2), 14.1. Māradhītaravatthu - para. 9; (8) KNA Jātaka 1 (vol.1) – Nidānakathā - 2. Avidūrenidānakathā - para. 38; (9) KNA Jātaka 1 (vol.4) - 11.[460] 6. Yudhañcayajātakavaṇṇanā - para. 1; (10) KNA Vimānavatthu 2.7.7. Kaṇḡakavimānavavaṇṇanā - para. 81; (11) KNA Therīgāthā 1.1. Aññatarātherīgāthāvaṇṇanā - para. 5; (12) KNA Apadāna 1.2. Avidūrenidānakathā - para. 39; (13) KNA Buddhavaṃsa, Nidānakathā - Abbhantaranidānaṃ - 1. Ratanacariḡamanakaṇḡdavaṇṇanā - para. 9; (14) VinA 1.2.12. Dubbacasikkhāpadavaṇṇanā - para. 1; (15) Vinaya Ṭikā 1. Verañjakaṇḡdavaṇṇanā - para. 32; (16) AbhiA Dhammasaṇḡanī – Nidānakathā – Sumedhakathā - para. 583.*

<sup>12</sup> *Āvuso* is a word often used among monks in the Pāḡi scriptures, regardless their monastic seniority. It is translated as "friend", "brother", etc. According to the PTS dictionary, it has descended from *āyusmanto*. In the Buddha's time the word "*āyasmā*" was however an address used for a superior person. In *Dīḡha Nikāya 16. Parinibbāna Sutta - Tathāḡatapacchimavācā* the Buddha is reported to decide that junior monks will address elder monks as "*bhante*" ("exalted one") or "*āyasmā*" ("elder"; "venerable"), whereas the elder monks would address the juniors by their name, clan, or as *āvuso*. To prevent unnecessary *faux pas* when monks encounter one another and do not know the seniority of the second one, it is traditionally followed that all monks treat one another in the most respectful way, especially in official settings.

<sup>13</sup> The Sub-Commentary explains, that he was "long" in height, and had brown eyes – "*turiḡasariṇatāya dīḡho, piṇḡalacakkhutāya piṇḡalo*" – "long because of the height of body, (and) brown because of the brown eyes." Pāḡi-Burmese dictionary however explains, that he was "long (with) weird eyes" ("ရှည်၍ ကြောင်သော မျက်စိရှိသော"), hence he was called "Āḡāra". The dictionary also says that "weird" means "gay and mad" ("မြူးရူး"), a Burmese word that I have possibly misunderstood. I suppose that "brown eyes" are "weird" because eyes of Indians are usually black.

<i>Viharatāyasmāti viharatu āyasmā.</i>	"May the venerable sir stay" (means) may the venerable sir stay. [The Commentary just separated the conjoined words.]
<i>Yattha viññū purisoti yasmim dhamme paṇḍito puriso.</i>	"Where the knowledgeable man" means in which teachings a wise man.
<i>Sakaṃ ācariyakanti attano ācariyasamayaṃ.</i>	"Own teacher" means the understanding of (one's) own teacher.
<i>Upasampajja vihareyyāti paṭilabhitvā vihareyya.</i>	"May (...) enter, and dwell" means having attained, (he) might dwell.
<i>Ettāvatā tena okāso kato hoti.</i>	So much was the opportunity given (/ "made") by him (i.e. Kālāma).
<i>Taṃ dhammanti taṃ tesam samayaṃ tantim.</i>	"That teachings" means (learning) the procedure of that understanding (/attainment) by them (i.e. the student-ascetics).
<i>Pariyāpuṇinti sutvāva uggaṇhim.</i>	"I mastered" means I have memorized (it all) having just heard (it once).

<i>So kho ahaṃ, bhāradvāja, tāvatakeneva oṭṭhapahatamattena lapitalāpanamattena 'ñāṇavādañca vadāmi, theravādañca jānāmi, passāmi'ti ca paṭijānāmi, ahañceva aññe ca.</i>	Thus I, Bhāradvāja, (at that time) claimed: "I speak the teachings on knowledge, know and see the teachings on eternity," only by the contact of lips (during saying it), only by repeating what (Ālāra Kālāma) said; both me and others. <sup>14</sup>
<i>Tassa mayhaṃ, bhāradvāja, etadahosi – 'na kho ālāro kālāmo imaṃ dhammaṃ kevalaṃ saddhāmatkena sayaṃ abhiññā sacchikavā upasampajja viharāmi'ti pavedeti; addhā ālāro kālāmo imaṃ dhammaṃ jānaṃ passaṃ viharati'ti.</i>	Then, Bhāradvāja, it occurred to me: "Indeed, Ālāra Kālāma does not claim 'I have attained, enter, (and) dwell in this teachings by (my) own supernatural knowledge' entirely just by faith; verily, Ālāra Kālāma dwells in this teachings knowing (and) seeing (it in reality).

<i>Oṭṭhapahatamattenāti tena vuttassa paṭiggahaṇatthaṃ oṭṭhapaharaṇamattena; aparāparaṃ katvā oṭṭhasañcaraṇamattakenāti attho.</i>	"as much as is the contact of lips (during saying so)" has the meaning that what was said by him (i.e. Kālāma), the grasped/learned meaning was (repeated) as much as is the beating of lips; doing (so) again and again, just moving the lips.
<i>Lapitalāpanamattenāti tena lapitassa paṭilāpanamattakena.</i>	"as much as is the repeating of what (Ālāra Kālāma) said" means just by repeating after him who spoke.

<sup>14</sup> This seems to refer to Brahmin Saṅgārava's question in the beginning, and the Buddha here explains he was the first of the three kinds of those who claim enlightenment. Tipiṭakadhara Mingun Sayadaw explains: "Just by repeating what the teacher uttered with slight lip-movements, the Bodhisatta reached the stage of learning at which he could say, 'I have understood!' In fact, he did declare, 'I have understood! I have seen the course!' and the Sect-leader and his other disciples also agreed to his declaration." (From *"The Great Chronicle of Buddhas"*, The Most Venerable Mingun Sayadaw Bhaddanta Vicittasārābhavaṃsa, tr. U Ko Lay & U Tin Lwin, The State Buddha Sāsana Council, Ti=Ni Publishing Center, 2006 [second edition]; vol.2, p.140/PDF p.158.)



<i>Ñāṇavādanti jānāmi vādaṃ.</i>	"I know the teachings on knowledge" <sup>15</sup> means the (particular) teaching.
<i>Theravādanti thirabhāvavādaṃ, thero ahametthāti etaṃ vacanaṃ.</i>	"Teachings on eternity" means the teachings on permanence; "there (he) said 'permanence'" is the (meaning of) the word. <sup>16</sup>
<i>Ahañceva aññe cāti na kevalaṃ ahaṃ, aññepi bahū evaṃ vadanti.</i>	"Both me as well as others" means not just me, many others say so too.
<i>Kevalaṃ saddhāmattakenāti paññāya asacchikatvā suddhena saddhāmattakeneva.</i>	"Entirely just by faith" means not having attained it by wisdom, believing just as much as faith (can).
<i>Bodhisatto kira vācāya dhammaṃ uggaṇhantoyeva,</i>	In fact, just as the <i>bodhisatta</i> by word memorized ("grasped") the teachings,
<i>"na kālāmassa vācāya pariyattimattameva asmiṃ dhamme, addhā esa sattannaṃ samāpattinaṃ lābhi"ti aññāsi, tenassa etadahosi.</i>	He realized: "Kālāma doesn't (understand) that teaching only to the extent of memorizing it by word, verily he has attained the seven attainments" <sup>17</sup> , thus it occurred (to the <i>bodhisatta</i> ).

<i>"Atha khvāhaṃ, bhāradvāja, yena ālāro kālāmo tenupasaṅkamim; upasaṅkamitvā ālāraṃ kālāmaṃ etadavocaṃ –</i>	"Then I, Bhāradvāja, indeed approached there where was Ālāra Kālāma. Having approached (him), I told this to Ālāra Kālāma:
<i>'kittāvatā no, āvuso kālāma, imaṃ dhammaṃ sayaṃ abhiññā sacchikatvā upasampajja viharāmi pavesesī'ti?</i>	"Friend Kālāma, to what extent do (you) proclaim to us: 'I attain, enter, (and) dwell in this teachings by (my) own supernatural knowledge'?"

<sup>15</sup> Note that the Commentary here apparently follows a different version of the text, which is however not uncommon (in irrelevant cases). The main text says *"ñāṇavādañca vadāmi"* = "I speak the teachings on knowledge", whereas the Commentary reads *"ñāṇavādañca jānāmi"* = "I know the teachings on knowledge."

<sup>16</sup> *"Thero ahamettha"* makes sense if it was out of context; it would mean "There I am the elder." – *"thero"* (= elder), *"ahaṃ"* (= I), *"ettha"* (= there). In the context it however doesn't make any sense. Could it be so, that instead of *"ahamettha"* it should be *"āhamettha"* (a kind of difference commonly found in different versions of Pāli text), joining in a nontraditional way the word *"āha"* (= said), and *"ettha"* (= there)? In fact, the Pāli-Burmese verbatim translation (*MVA1* vol.3 p.20 (PDF p.20)) seems to follow exactly that version of the Pāli text. It says: *"Theravādanti, ထေရဝါဒီဟူသည့်ကား; thirabhāvavādaṃ, မြဲမြံစွာဖြစ်၏ဟူသော စကားကို; ettha, ဤအယူ၌; thiro, မြဲမြံစွာဖြစ်၏; iti etaṃ vacanaṃ, ဤစကားကို; āha, ဆိုပြီး"* = *"Theravāda"* means the teachings on permanence; there (i.e. in that belief) (the attainment) is permanent; thus (the Buddha) told that word (*theravāda*)." So, instead of *"thero ahamettha"* this author's version possibly read *"thiro āha(m)ettha."* The Sub-Commentary adds *"akampanīyatāya thiro"* (= "permanent by (its) stability ("non-trembling)").

The aim of the *bodhisatta*, the Buddha-to-be, was to find a permanent attainment, permanent freedom from Cycle of Birth, permanent freedom from birth, old age, and death. Therefore, "Teachings on permanence" was exactly that what the *bodhisatta* searched for. Unlike in the Buddha's Teachings, where all attainments are impermanent in terms of the mental experience, and only the final passing away (*Parinibbāna*) is permanent, in this case Ālāra Kālāma (as well as Udaka, the son of Rāma) believed, that the attainment of the Base of Nothingness is a permanent attainment, because it seems to be so when it is experienced. In the context of the name of the Buddhist school the term *Theravāda* is exclusively used for the "Teachings of Elders". In fact, the word *theravāda* in the sense of "teachings on permanence" appears only in the narrative of the prince Siddhattha becoming an ascetic and training with the then teachers - *Majjhima Nikāya suttas 26, 36, 85, and 100* - where it reflects only the ideas of Ālāra Kālāma and Udaka, the son of Rāma.

<sup>17</sup> There are altogether "eight attainments" in the *samatha* (concentration) practice, four "material absorptions" (*rūpa jhāna*) and four "immaterial absorptions" (*arūpa jhāna*). The attainment of Base of Nothingness taught by Ālāra Kālāma is the third immaterial absorption, attained by passing through the preceding four material and two immaterial absorptions.

<i>Evaṃ vutte, bhāradvāja, ālāro kālāmo ākiñcaññāyatanaṃ pavedesi.</i>	Having spoken thus, Bhāradvāja, Ālāra Kālāma proclaimed (his attainment as) the Base of Nothingness. <sup>18</sup>
<i>Tassa mayhaṃ, bhāradvāja, etadahosi – 'na kho ālārasseva kālāmassa atthi saddhā, mayhaṃpatthi saddhā; na kho ālārasseva kālāmassa atthi vīriyaṃ...pe... sati... samādhi... paññā, mayhaṃpatthi paññā.</i>	Then, Bhāradvāja, this occurred to me: "Indeed, not only Ālāra Kālāma has faith, I also have faith indeed; not only Ālāra Kālāma has energy...rep... mindfulness... concentration... wisdom, I also have wisdom indeed.
<i>Yaṃnūnāhaṃ yaṃ dhammaṃ ālāro kālāmo sayāṃ abhiññā sacchikatvā upasampajja viharāmiṃti pavedeti tassa dhammassa sacchikiriyāya padaheyya'nti.</i>	What if I endeavored to attain that teachings which ("teachings") Ālāra Kālāma proclaims (as): "I attain, enter, (and) dwell in (this teaching) by (my) own supernatural knowledge."
<i>So kho ahaṃ, bhāradvāja, nacirasseva khippameva taṃ dhammaṃ sayāṃ abhiññā sacchikatvā upasampajja vihāsiṃ.</i>	Hence I, Bhāradvāja, indeed soon, indeed quickly, attained, entered, (and) dwelled in that teachings by (my) own supernatural knowledge.

<i>Ākiñcaññāyatanaṃ pavedesīti ākiñcaññāyatanapariyosānā satta samāpattiyo maṃ jānāpesi.</i>	"Proclaimed the Base of Nothingness" means he announced to me the seven attainments ending with the Base of Nothingness (as attained by him).
<i>Saddhāti imāsaṃ sattannaṃ samāpattinaṃ nibbattanattāya saddhā.</i>	"Faith" means the faith necessary for attaining these seven attainments.
<i>Vīriyādīsopi eveda nayo.</i>	In energy, etc. the way (of explanation) is same (as with faith).
<i>Padaheyyanti payogaṃ kareyyaṃ.</i>	"If I endeavored" means if I made effort.
<i>Nacirasseva taṃ dhammaṃ sayāṃ abhiññā sacchikatvā upasampajja vihāsiṃti bodhisatto kira vīriyaṃ paggaheṭvā</i>	"indeed soon, quickly, attained, entered, (and) dwelled in that teachings by (my) own supernatural knowledge" means that the <i>bodhisatta</i> indeed concentrated (his) energy, and
<i>katipāhaññeva satta suvaṇṇanissenīyo pasārento viya satta samāpattiyo nibbattesi; tasmā evamāha.</i>	Just within a few days <sup>19</sup> attained the seven attainments as if (just) spreading seven ladders (made of Indian madder); hence (the Buddha) said so.

<i>Atha khvāhaṃ, bhāradvāja, yena ālāro kālāmo tenupasaṅkamim; upasaṅkamitvā ālāraṃ kālāmaṃ etadavocaṃ –</i>	Then I, Bhāradvāja, indeed approached there where was Ālāra Kālāma. When I approached (him), I told this to Ālāra Kālāma:
--	---

<sup>18</sup> *Visuddhimagga* explains the Base of Nothingness in detail. See below its explanation of the word-meaning:

"... it has no owning (*kiñcana*), this it is non-owning (*akiñcana*); what is meant is that it has not even the mere act of its dissolution remaining. The state (essence) of non-owning is nothingness (*ākiñcañña*). This is a term for the disappearance of the consciousness belonging to the base consisting of boundless space [i.e. the sixth absorption]. That nothingness is the "base" in the sense of foundation for that jhāna, as the "deities' base" [*devāyatana*, i.e. heaven] is for deities, thus it is the "base consisting of nothingness." (From "*Path of Purification (Visuddhimagga)*", by Bhaddantācariya Buddhaghosa, tr. by Bhikkhu Ñāṇamoli, Buddhist Publication Society, 2010 [first edition in 1975]; pp.329-330/PDF pp.387-388. I have omitted footnotes and par. numbering to encourage reading of the original book.)

<sup>19</sup> I.e. two or three days (says the verbatim Pāli-Burmese translation). Ordinary people may need a decade or two.



<i>'ettāvatā no, āvuso kālāma, imaṃ dhammaṃ sayaṃ abhiññā sacchikatvā upasampajja pavedesī'ti?</i>	'Is it this much, friend Kālāma, that you proclaim to us the attainment (and) entering this teaching by (one's) own supernatural knowledge?
<i>'Ettāvatā kho ahaṃ, āvuso, imaṃ dhammaṃ sayaṃ abhiññā sacchikatvā upasampajja pavedemi'ti.</i>	"Indeed that much, friend, I proclaim the attainment (and) entering this teaching by (one's) own supernatural knowledge.
<i>'Ahampi kho, āvuso, ettāvatā imaṃ dhammaṃ sayaṃ abhiññā sacchikatvā upasampajja viharāmi'ti.</i>	"Even I, friend, have that much attained, entered, (and) dwell in this teaching by (my) own supernatural knowledge.
<i>'Lābhā no, āvuso, suladdhaṃ no, āvuso, ye mayaṃ āyasmantaṃ tādisaṃ sabrahmacāriṃ passāma.</i>	"It is gain for us, friend, it is a good gain for us, friend, that we see the venerable sir of such a good holy life.
<i>Iti yāhaṃ dhammaṃ sayaṃ abhiññā sacchikatvā upasampajja pavedemi taṃ tvaṃ dhammaṃ sayaṃ abhiññā sacchikatvā upasampajja viharasi;</i>	Thus the teaching of which I proclaim attainment (and) entrance by (one's) own supernatural knowledge, that (same) teaching you have attained, entered, (and) dwell in by (your) own supernatural knowledge.
<i>yaṃ tvaṃ dhammaṃ sayaṃ abhiññā sacchikatvā upasampajja viharasi tamahaṃ dhammaṃ sayaṃ abhiññā sacchikatvā upasampajja pavedemi.</i>	That teaching that you have attained, entered, (and) dwell in by (your) own supernatural knowledge, that (is) the teaching of which I proclaim attainment (and) entrance by (one's) own supernatural knowledge.
<i>Iti yāhaṃ dhammaṃ jānāmi taṃ tvaṃ dhammaṃ jānāsi, yaṃ tvaṃ dhammaṃ jānāsi tamahaṃ dhammaṃ jānāmi.</i>	Thus the teaching that I know, that (same) teaching you know, that teaching that you know, that (same) teaching I know.
<i>Iti yādiso ahaṃ tādiso tuvaṃ, yādiso tuvaṃ tādiso ahaṃ.</i>	Thus as am I you are same, as are you, I am same.
<i>Ehi dāni, āvuso, ubhova santā imaṃ gaṇaṃ pariharāma'ti.</i>	Come, friend, now (we) shall care for this group (of students) staying both (together), indeed."
<i>Iti kho, bhāradvāja, ālāro kālāmo ācariyo me samāno attano antevāsiṃ maṃ samānaṃ attanā samasamaṃ ṭhapesi, uḷārāya ca maṃ pūjāya pūjesi.</i>	Thus, Bhāradvāja, Ālāra Kālāma being my teacher, me being his own student, placed me on the same level as himself, and offered to me the greatest offerings.
<i>Tassa mayhaṃ, bhāradvāja, etadahosi – 'nāyaṃ dhammo nibbidāya na virāgāya na nirodhāya na upasamāya na abhiññāya na sambodhāya na nibbānāya saṃvattati, yāvadeva ākiñcaññāyatanūpapattiyā'ti.</i>	Then, Bhāradvāja, this occurred to me: "This teaching does not culminate in dispassion (to rebirth), not in non-craving, not in cessation of lust, not in cessation of all defilement, not in supernatural knowledge, not in thorough awakening (to the Truth), not in the attainment of Enlightenment <sup>20</sup> , (being) as high (/ "much") as the arising of the Base of Nothingness."
<i>So kho ahaṃ, bhāradvāja, taṃ dhammaṃ analarīkaritvā tasmā dhammā nibbijja apakkamiṃ.</i>	Hence I, Bhāradvāja, indeed displeased with that teaching, and dispassionate for that teaching, I left.

<sup>20</sup> Here "Nibbāna" is understood in the ultimate meaning, keeping it therefore at the end. The word can be analysed into two parts: *ni* (= out), *vana* (= blow), and with the analogy of an oil-lamp or camp-fire that cannot burn more when there is no more fuel, *Nibbāna* is the ultimate cessation from rebirth caused by the absolute absence of all craving (*taṇhā*) and ignorance (*avijjā*).

<i>Lābhā no, āvusoti anusūyako kiresa kālāmo.</i>	"It is gain for us, friend" means that Kālāma was indeed not jealous.
<i>Tasmā "ayaṃ adhunāgato, kinti katvā imaṃ dhammaṃ nibbattesī"ti usūyaṃ akatvā pasanno pasādaṃ pavedento evamāha.</i>	Therefore, not being jealous (/ "making jealousy") (thinking): "this (one) has (just) now come, what did (he) do that (he) attained this teaching (so quickly)?" And respectfully expressing respect, said so (the Buddha).
<i>Ubhova santā imaṃ gaṇaṃ pariharāmāti "mahā ayaṃ gaṇo, dvepi janā pariharāmā"ti vatvā gaṇassa saññaṃ adāsi,</i>	"(We) shall carry out (the teaching) for this group (of students) staying both (together), indeed" means "large is this group, (we) will carry out (the teaching) in two indeed" said (Kālāma) and announced to the group:
<i>"ahampi sattannaṃ samāpattinaṃ lābhī, mahāpurisopi sattannameva, ettakā janā mahāpurisassa santike parikammaṃ uggaṇhatha, ettakā mayha"nti majjhe bhinditvā adāsi.</i>	"As well as I have attained the seven attainments, the great man (attained) just the seven too; this number of people take the meditation instruction from the great man, this number of people from me" (saying so) he divided (his students) in the middle and gave (one half to the <i>bodhisatta</i> ).
<i>Uḷārāyāti uttamāya.</i>	"By the greatest" means by ultimate.
<i>Pūjāyāti kālāmassa kira upaṭṭhākā itthiyopi purisāpi gandhamālādīni gahetvā āgacchanti.</i>	"Offerings" means indeed, the women and men as well who supported Kālāma took perfumes (and) flowers and arrived (to Kālāma's place).
<i>Kālāmo – "gacchatha, mahāpurisaṃ pūjethā"ti vadati.</i>	Kālāma says: "Go (pl.), make offerings to the great man."
<i>Te taṃ pūjetvā yaṃ avasiṭṭhaṃ hoti, tena kālāmaṃ pūjenti.</i>	They made offerings for him (i.e. the <i>bodhisatta</i> ), and what remained, by that they made offerings for Kālāma.
<i>Mahagghāni mañcapīṭhāni āharanti; tānīpi mahāpurisassa dāpetvā yadi avasiṭṭhaṃ hoti, attanā gaṇhāti.</i>	(The people) bring valuable beds (and) chairs, those they also offer to the great man and what was the leftover, that (Kālāma) takes himself.
<i>Gatagataṭṭhāne varasenāsaṇaṃ bodhisattassa jaggāpetvā sesakaṃ attanā gaṇhāti.</i>	Wherever (they) went, (Kālāma) requested (people) to clean the supreme bedding and himself took what remained.
<i>Evaṃ uḷārāya pūjāya pūjesi.</i>	Thus (Kālāma) offered the greatest offerings.
<i>Nāyaṃ dhammo nibbidāyātiādīsu ayaṃ sattasamāpattidhammo neva vaṭṭe nibbindanatthāya, na virajjanatthāya, na rāgādinirodhatthāya,</i>	"This teaching does not culminate in dispassion etc." means "this teaching of seven attainments is neither for the dispassion for rebirth, nor for removal of (mental) defilement, nor for cessation of lust,
<i>na upasamatthāya, na abhiññeyyadhammaṃ abhijānanatthāya, na catumaggasambodhāya<sup>21</sup>, na nibbānasacchikiriyaṃ saṃvattatīti attho.</i>	Nor for cessation of all defilement, nor for supernatural realization of the teachings that should be known supernaturally, nor does it culminate in the Awakening by the Four Paths <sup>22</sup> , (or) in the attainment of Enlightenment;" (that) is the meaning.

<sup>21</sup> The verbatim Pāli-Burmese translation has instead "*catusaccasambodhāya*" (= Awakening into the Four (Noble) Truths).

<sup>22</sup> There are four levels so called "Fruitings" (*Phala*) of Awakening/Enlightenment, and each is preceded by "Path" (*Magga*). Thus there are Four Paths and Four Fruitings for each level of Enlightenment.

<i>Yāvadeva ākiñcaññāyatanūpapattiyāti yāva saṭṭhikappasahassāyuparimāṇe ākiñcaññāyatanabhava upapatti, tāvadeva saṁvattati, na tato uddham.</i>	"(Being) as high (/ "much") as the arising of the Base of Nothingness" means it culminates only in as much as is the birth in the existence of Base of Nothingness where the life-span has the extent of sixty-thousand aeons, not more than that.
<i>Evamayam punarāvattanadhammoyeva; yañca thānaṁ pāpeti, taṁ jātijarāmaṇehi aparimuttameva maccupāsaparikkhittamevāti.</i>	Thus this is just a teaching that (leads) to further rebirth; the place that (the teaching) takes (one) to, that (place) is simply not free from birth, old age, (and) death; (it) is simply surrounded by the fetter of death. <sup>23</sup>
<i>Tato paṭṭhāya ca pana mahāsatto yathā nāma chātajjhappuriso manuññābhojanaṁ labhitvā sampiyāyamānopi bhuñjitvā</i>	And right since then the great being, like for example when a man who (suffered) hunger pangs has received delicious food and ate (it) with appetite,
<i>pittavasena vā semhavasena vā makkhikāvasena<sup>24</sup> vā chaḍḍetvā puna ekaṁ piṇḍampi bhuñjissāmiṃti maṇaṁ na uppādeti;</i>	Upon refusing it due to a bile (ailment), or due to a phlegm (ailment), or due flies will not arouse the desire (thinking): "I will eat one more lump;"
<i>evameva imā satta samāpattiyo mahantena ussāhena nibbattetvāpi, tāsu imaṁ punarāvattikādhedam ādīnavaṁ disvā,</i>	In just that way (the great being), having attained these seven attainments by great effort, having seen this their drawbacks in detail, such as continued rebirth, <sup>25</sup>
<i>puna imaṁ dhammaṁ āvajjissāmi vā samāpajjissāmi vā adhiṭṭhahissāmi vā vuṭṭhahissāmi vā paccavekkhissāmi vāti cittameva na uppādesi.</i>	Didn't arouse even a thought (such as): (1) "I will consider this attainment again", or (2) "I will attain (it)", or (3) "I will make determination (to dwell in it)", or (4) "I will exit (/ "rise up) (from it)", or (5) "I will reflect (on it)." <sup>26</sup>
<i>Analarikarivāti alaṁ iminā, alaṁ imināti punappunaṁ alarikarivā<sup>27</sup>.</i>	"Displeased" means "enough of this, enough of this" saying (/ "doing") "enough" repeatedly.
<i>Nibbijāti nibbinditvā.</i>	"Dispassionate" means being disgusted.
<i>Apakkaminti agamāsīm.</i>	"I left" means I went (away).

<sup>23</sup> Tipiṭakadhara Mingun Sayadaw says: "It is, in fact, a region already encircled by the snares of the King of Death." (*The Chronicle of Buddhas*, vol.2, p.144/PDF p.162.)

<sup>24</sup> The verbatim Pāli-Burmese translation has instead "*pacchimakāvasena*" (= due to (the food) being of inferior (quality)). I suppose this means stale etc. The Sub-Commentary however also reads *makkhikāvasena* and explains: "*Makkhikāvasenāti bhojanassa makkhikāmissatāvasena*" = "Due to flies' means due to the food being mixed with flies."

<sup>25</sup> The Sub-Commentary glosses: "*Bodhisattassa tā samāpattiyo nibbattetvā thitassa purimajātīparicayena ñāṇassa ca mahantatāya tāsaṁ gati ca abhisamparāyo ca upaṭṭhāsi.*" = "When the *bodhisatta* attained those attainments, he realized (/ "occurred") the next birth (caused by the attainments) as well as the birth after the next, through (his) knowledge by acquaintance with (his) previous lives and the greatness (of the *bodhisatta*)." So it seems the *bodhisatta* remembered his past lives, or at least some of them. Then some may ask: "If the *bodhisatta* remembered his past lives, why didn't he simply follow the Middle Path taught to him by Buddhas of the past?" I suppose that these were exactly the lives he still didn't remember, or perhaps he remembered them but not with sufficient detail.

<sup>26</sup> These are the five masteries (*pañca vasiyo*) of *samatha* practice. These masteries are necessary to practice in order to purify the already attained attainment of absorption (*jhāna*), they are usually not taught to beginners.

<sup>27</sup> The Sub-Commentary says "*Analarikarivāti anu anu alaṁkatvā*" = "Displeased" means saying (/ "doing") "enough" again and again." – The word *analarikarivā* is therefore analysed into *anu* (= repeatedly) and *alarikarivā* (= saying "enough"). From this explanation "*alarikarivā*" well fits the context of the original text as well as the Commentaries, i.e. when we take this second sense of the word - *alaṁ karoti* (= "says 'enough'") instead of the more common *alarikaroti* (= "decorates").

476. "So kho ahaṃ, bhāradvāja, kiṃkusalagavesī anuttaraṃ santivarapadaṃ pariyesaṃāno yena udako rāmaputto tenupasaṅkamim; upasaṅkamitvā udakaṃ rāmaputtaṃ etadavocaṃ –	476. "Then thus, having gone forth, (I) was searching what was skilful, the supreme word ("Enlightenment") of the ultimate peace. Seeking (that), I approached where there was Udaka, the son of Rāma. Having approached (him), I told this to Udaka, the son of Rāma:
'icchāmaṃ, āvuso [passa ma. ni. 1.278 pāsārāsīsutte], <sup>28</sup> imasmiṃ dhammavinaye brahmacariyaṃ carituṃti.	"Friend [see (a comment) in <i>MN 26. Pāsārāsī Sutta</i> , par.278], I want to live holy life in this teachings and discipline."
Evaṃ vutte, bhāradvāja, udako rāmaputto maṃ etadavoca – 'viharatāyasmā.	Saying so, Bhāradvāja, Udaka, the son of Rāma told me this: May the venerable sir stay (here);
Tādiso ayaṃ dhammo yattha viññū puriso nacirasseva sakaṃ ācariyakaṃ sayam abhiññā sacchikatvā upasampajja vihareyyā'ti.	This is the kind of teachings, where the knowledgeable man might soon attain, enter, and dwell by (his) own supernatural knowledge in the (attainment) of (his) own teacher."
So kho ahaṃ, bhāradvāja, nacirasseva khippameva taṃ dhammaṃ pariyāpuṇim.	Hence I, Bhāradvāja, soon, indeed quickly, mastered that teachings.
So kho ahaṃ, bhāradvāja, tāvatakeneva oṭṭhapahatamattena lapitalāpanamattena 'ñāṇavādaṇca vadāmi, theravādaṇca jānāmi, passāmi'ti ca paṭijānāmi, ahañceva aññe ca.	Thus I, Bhāradvāja, (at that time) claim that I speak the teachings on knowledge, know and see the teachings on eternity: as much as is the contact of lips (during saying so), as much as is the repeating of what (Udaka) said; both me and others.
Tassa mayhaṃ, bhāradvāja, etadahosi – 'na kho rāmo imaṃ dhammaṃ kevalaṃ saddhāṃattakena sayam abhiññā sacchikatvā upasampajja viharāmi'ti pavedesi; addhā rāmo imaṃ dhammaṃ jānaṃ passaṃ vihaṃsī'ti.	Then, Bhāradvāja, it occurred to me: "Indeed, Rāma did not claim 'I have attained, enter, (and) dwell in this teachings by (my) own supernatural knowledge' entirely just by faith; verily, Rāma dwelled in this teachings knowing (and) seeing (it in reality).
Atha khvāhaṃ, bhāradvāja, yena udako rāmaputto tenupasaṅkamim; upasaṅkamitvā udakaṃ rāmaputtaṃ etadavocaṃ –	"So I, Bhāradvāja, indeed approached there where was Udaka, the son of Rāma. Having approached (him), I told this to Udaka, the son of Rāma:
'kittāvatā no, āvuso, rāmo imaṃ dhammaṃ sayam abhiññā sacchikatvā upasampajja viharāmi'ti pavedesi'ti?	"Friend, to what extent did Rāma proclaim: 'I attain, enter, (and) dwell in this teachings by (my) own supernatural knowledge'?"

<sup>28</sup> A gloss here refers us to first version of this text in this book (*Majjhima Nikāya*), namely in *Pāsārāsī Sutta* (also known as *Ariyapariyesanā Sutta*), MN 26. There we find a nice critique (I suppose composed by Tipiṭakadhara Mingun Sayadaw) of the mistake which occurs in the Sinhalese (Sri Lankan), Thai, and Cambodian/Khmer texts, which goes in contradiction to the story and is refuted by the Sub-Commentaries as well. In fact, the mistake *formerly* led I.B. Horner and other great Pāli scholars in the west to suppose that the *bodhisatta* visited Udaka Rāma (because the non-Burmese texts claim the *bodhisatta* called his new teacher as "Rāma" – "*āvuso rāma*") and learned the eighth attainment from Rāma himself. The Burmese version, again of course well acquainted with the Sub-Commentaries, is clear that Udaka was son of Rāma (hence his correct name Udaka Rāmaputta), and he (i.e. Udaka) was not a teacher of the *bodhisatta* (in the sense of attainments), because both had the seventh attainment. Hence they were "*sabrahmacārī*" (i.e. companions in holy life), rather than a teacher and a student. (Note that the two are here compared by attainment, not by knowledge.)

<i>Evaṃ vutte, bhāradvāja, udako rāmaputto nevasaññānāsaññāyatanaṃ pavedesi.</i>	Having spoken thus, Bhāradvāja, Udaka, the son of Rāma proclaimed (the attainment as) the Base of Neither-Perception-Nor-Non-Perception. <sup>29</sup>
<i>Tassa mayhaṃ, bhāradvāja, etadahosi – 'na kho rāmasseva ahosi saddhā, mayhaṃpatthi saddhā; na kho rāmasseva ahosi vīriyaṃ...pe... sati... samādhi... paññā, mayhaṃpatthi paññā.</i>	Then, Bhāradvāja, this occurred to me: "Indeed, not only Rāma had faith, I also have faith indeed; not only Rāma had energy ...rep... mindfulness... concentration... wisdom, I also have wisdom indeed.
<i>Yaṃnūnāhaṃ yaṃ dhammaṃ rāmo sayāṃ abhiññā sacchikatvā upasampajja viharāmiṃti pavedesi tassa dhammassa sacchikiriyāya padaheyya'nti.</i>	What if I endeavored to attain that teachings which ("teachings") Rāma proclaimed (as): "I attain, enter, (and) dwell in (this teaching) by (my) own supernatural knowledge."
<i>So kho ahaṃ, bhāradvāja, nacirasseva khippameva taṃ dhammaṃ sayāṃ abhiññā sacchikatvā upasampajja vihāsiṃ.</i>	Hence I, Bhāradvāja, indeed soon, quickly, attained, entered, (and) dwelled in that teachings by (my) own supernatural knowledge.

<i>"Atha khvāhaṃ, bhāradvāja, yena udako rāmaputto tenupasaṅkamim; upasaṅkamitvā udakaṃ rāmaputtaṃ etadavocaṃ –</i>	Then I, Bhāradvāja, indeed approached there where was Udaka, the son of Rāma. When I approached (him), I told this to Udaka, the son of Rāma:
<i>'ettāvatā no, āvuso, rāmo imaṃ dhammaṃ sayāṃ abhiññā sacchikatvā upasampajja pavedesi'ti?</i>	'Is it this much, friend, that Rāma proclaimed the attainment (and) entering this teaching by (one's) own supernatural knowledge?

<sup>29</sup> The explanation of "Base of Neither-Perception-Nor-Non-Perception" is illustratively supplied by *Visuddhimagga*:

"The word meaning here is this: that jhāna with its associated states neither has perception nor has no perception because of the absence of gross perception and the presence of subtle perception, thus it is "neither perception nor non-perception" (*n'eva-saññā-nāsaññā*). It is "neither perception nor non-perception" and it is a "base" (*āyatana*) because it is included in the mind-base (*manāyatana*) and the mental-object base (*dhammāyatana*), thus it is the "base consisting of neither perception nor non-perception" (*nevasaññānāsaññāyatana*). [The Sub-Commentary for *Visuddhimagga* explains, that "perception" was selected from these states for the name of the attainment in respect of the difference in beings due to perception, in the way it is mentioned in *DN 33. Saṅgīti Sutta (Navasattāvāsā)* and *AN 9.3.4. Sattāvāsa S.*]

Or alternatively: the perception here is neither perception, since it is incapable of performing the decisive function of perception, nor yet non-perception, since it is present in a subtle state as a residual formation, thus it is "neither perception nor non-perception." It is "neither perception nor non-perception" and it is a "base" in the sense of a foundation for the other states, thus it is the "base consisting of neither perception nor non-perception." And here it is not only perception that is like this, but feeling as well is neither-feeling-nor-non-feeling, consciousness is neither-consciousness-nor-non-consciousness, and contact is neither-contact-nor-non-contact, and the same description applies to the rest of the associated states; but it should be understood that this presentation is given in terms of perception.

And the meaning should be illustrated by the similes beginning with the smearing of oil on the bowl. A novice smeared a bowl with oil, it seems, and laid it aside. When it was time to drink gruel, an elder told him to bring the bowl. He said, "Venerable sir, there is oil in the bowl." But then when he was told, "Bring the oil, novice, I shall fill the oil tube," he replied, "There is no oil, venerable sir." Herein, just as "There is oil" is in the sense of incompatibility with the gruel because it has been poured into [the bowl] and just as "There is no oil" is in the sense of filling the oil tube, etc., so too this perception is "neither perception" since it is incapable of performing the decisive function of perception and it is "nor non-perception" because it is present in a subtle form as a residual formation." (From *"Path of Purification (Visuddhimagga)"*, by Bhaddantācariya Buddhaghosa, tr. by Bhikkhu Ñāṇamoli, Buddhist Publication Society, 2010 [first edition in 1975]; pp.332-333/PDF pp.390-391. (I have omitted footnotes and par. numbering to encourage reading of the original book.)



<i>'Ettāvatā kho, āvuso, rāmo imaṃ dhammaṃ sayaṃ abhiññā sacchikatvā upasampajja pavedesī'ti.</i>	"Indeed that much, friend, Rāma proclaimed the attainment (and) entering this teaching by (one's) own supernatural knowledge.
<i>'Ahampi kho, āvuso, ettāvatā imaṃ dhammaṃ sayaṃ abhiññā sacchikatvā upasampajja viharāmi'ti.</i>	"Even I, friend, have that much attained, entered, (and) dwell in this teaching by (my) own supernatural knowledge.
<i>'Lābhā no, āvuso, suladdhaṃ no, āvuso, ye mayaṃ āyasmantaṃ tādisaṃ sabrahmacāriṃ passāma.</i>	"It is gain for us, friend, it is a good gain for us, friend, that we see the venerable sir of such a good holy life.
<i>Iti yaṃ dhammaṃ rāmo sayaṃ abhiññā sacchikatvā upasampajja pavedesi taṃ tvaṃ dhammaṃ sayaṃ abhiññā sacchikatvā upasampajja viharasi;</i>	Thus the teaching of which Rāma proclaimed attainment (and) entrance by (one's) own supernatural knowledge, that (same) teaching you have attained, entered, (and) dwell in by (your) own supernatural knowledge.
<i>yaṃ tvaṃ dhammaṃ sayaṃ abhiññā sacchikatvā upasampajja viharasi taṃ dhammaṃ rāmo sayaṃ abhiññā sacchikatvā upasampajja pavedesi.</i>	That teaching that you have attained, entered, (and) dwell in by (your) own supernatural knowledge, that (is) the teaching of which Rāma proclaimed attainment (and) entrance by (one's) own supernatural knowledge.
<i>Iti yaṃ dhammaṃ rāmo abhiññāsi taṃ tvaṃ dhammaṃ jānāsi, yaṃ tvaṃ dhammaṃ jānāsi taṃ dhammaṃ rāmo abhiññāsi.</i>	Thus the teaching that Rāma supernaturally knew, that (same) teaching you know, that teaching that you know, that (same) teaching Rāma supernaturally knew.
<i>Iti yādiso rāmo ahosi tādiso tuvaṃ, yādiso tuvaṃ tādiso rāmo ahosi.</i>	Thus as was Rāma you are same, as are you, Rāma was same.
<i>Ehi dāni, āvuso, tuvaṃ imaṃ gaṇaṃ pariharā'ti.</i>	Come, friend, now you shall carry out (the teaching) for this group (of students).
<i>Iti kho, bhāradvāja, udako rāmaputto sabrahmacārī me samāno ācariyaṭṭhāne maṃ ṭhapesi, uḷārāya ca maṃ pūjāya pūjesi.</i>	Thus, Bhāradvāja, Udaka, the son of Rāma, being (my) companion in holy life, placed me on the level of (his) teacher, and offered to me the greatest offerings (as well).
<i>Tassa mayhaṃ, bhāradvāja, etadahosi – 'nāyaṃ dhammo nibbidāya na virāgāya na nirodhāya na upasamāya na abhiññāya na sambodhāya na nibbānāya saṃvattati, yāvadeva nevasaññānāsaññāyatanūpapattiya'ti.</i>	Then, Bhāradvāja, this occurred to me: "This teaching does not culminate in dispassion (to rebirth), not in non-craving, not in cessation of lust, not in cessation of all defilement, not in supernatural knowledge, not in thorough awakening (to the Truth), not in the attainment of Enlightenment, (being) as high (/ "much") as the arising of the Base of Neither-Perception-Nor-Non-Perception." <sup>30</sup>
<i>So kho ahaṃ, bhāradvāja, taṃ dhammaṃ analaṅkaritvā tasmā dhammā nibbijja apakkamiṃ.</i>	Then I, Bhāradvāja, indeed displeased with that teaching, and dispassionate for that teaching, I left. <sup>31</sup>

<sup>30</sup> Tipiṭakadhara Mingun Sayadaw adds: "In fact, these eight attainments result at most only in the Brahma abode of Nevasaññā-nāsaññāyatana where one lives for eighty-four thousand *Mahā-kappas*, but they cannot produce any benefit superior to that. The highest Brahma world of Nevasaññā-nāsaññāyatana in which the same *Jhāna* results is also only a realm not liberated from the dangers of birth, decay and death. It is, in fact, a region already encircled by the snares of the King of Death." ( *"The Chronicle of Buddhas"*, vol.2, p.148/PDF p.166.)

<sup>31</sup> Ibid. p.145/PDF p.163.: "As for Udaka himself, only when the Bodhisatta had left him, he was greatly overcome by *saṃvega* [i.e. realizing the problem of life as an urgent matter] and (after he) made exertion to gain the attainments, he realized Jhānas up to Nevasaññā-nāsaññāyatana."



278. <i>Na kho rāmo imaṃ dhammanti idhāpi bodhisatto taṃ dhammaṃ uggahantoyeva aññāsi –</i>	278. "Indeed, Rāma (did not claim 'I have attained...' this teachings'" means even here, just when the <i>bodhisatta</i> (by word) memorized that teaching, he realized:
<i>"nāyaṃ aṭṭhasamāpattidhammo udakassa vācāya uggahitamattova, addhā panesa aṭṭhasamāpattilābhī"ti.</i>	"This teaching of eight attainments is not learned (by Rāma) only as much as is the word of Udaka, but verily he (i.e. Rāma) had attained the eight attainments (himself)."
<i>Tenassa etadahosi – "na kho rāmo...pe... jānaṃ passaṃ vihāsi"ti.</i>	Hence it occurred to him (i.e. to the <i>bodhisatta</i> ): "Indeed, Rāma did not...rep.... dwelled (in this teachings) knowing (and) seeing (it in reality)."
<i>Sesamettha purimavāre vuttanayeneva veditabbaṃ.</i>	What there (in the main text) remains (for explanation), that should be known from the previous portion in the way it was said (there).

May all beings be happy and healthy ☺

monk Saraṇa